



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Janet Fortier
DOCKET NO.: 11-04296.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 05-24-433-009

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Janet Fortier, the appellant, by attorney Laura Godek, of Laura Moore Godek, PC in McHenry; and the Kane County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Kane County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$24,996
IMPR.: \$58,079
TOTAL: \$83,075

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Kane County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2011 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 2-story dwelling of brick and frame construction with 2,708 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2006. Features of the home include a partial basement, central air conditioning and a 2-car garage.

The property has a 10,000 square foot site and is located in Elgin, Plato Township, Kane County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted an appraisal estimating the subject property had a market value of \$250,000 as of January 1, 2011 along with five comparable sales.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$89,991. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$275,813 or \$100.00 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2011 three year average median level of assessment for Kane County of 33.23% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on 11 comparable sales. The assessor questioned the use of comparable sales past the January 1, 2011 assessment date and more specifically beyond June 1, 2011.

In rebuttal, the appellant argued the board of review's sales were too remote in time and/or were new construction purchases.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appraisal submitted by the appellant. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$275,813 or \$100.00 per square foot of living area, including land, which is above the appraised value. The Board finds the appraiser made logical adjustments to the comparables for differences from the subject to arrive at a credible estimate of value, while the board of review made no adjustments to its sale comparables.

In addition, the assessor's letter submitted by the board of review indicates that 2011 assessments are based on sales that occurred from 2008 through 2010. In her letter, the assessor states: "I realize that PTAB is accepting same year sales but up to what point? When assessments are to be submitted to the county by June 1st, how can sales beyond that date possibly be used?" The Board gives this response little merit and finds the assessor's reliance on this assessment methodology to be highly misplaced in the appeal process.

The Board finds the valuation date at issue in this appeal is January 1, 2011. Section 9-155 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

On or before **June 1** in each general assessment year in all counties with less than 3,000,000 inhabitants, . . . the assessor, in person or by deputy, shall actually view and **determine as near as practicable the value of each property listed for taxation as of January 1 of that year**, or as provided by Section 9-180, and assess the property at 33 1/3% of its fair cash value, or in accordance with Sections 10-110 through 10-140. . . (35 ILCS 200/9-155).

The Board finds the legislature clearly contemplated subsequent events in the assessment process by inserting the language "On or before **June 1** . . . the assessor, in person or by deputy, shall actually view and **determine as near as practicable the value of each property listed for taxation as of January 1 of that year**. . . and assess the property at 33 1/3% of its fair cash value, or in accordance with Sections 10-110 through 10-140."

The Property Tax Appeal Board finds assessment officials are statutorily bound to determine a given property's fair cash value as near as practicable **as of** the date of January 1 of a given assessment year. The Board finds January 1 is the statutorily defined date to determine the correct classification or assessment for any real property in Illinois. Illinois courts recognized that assessing officials are not barred, as a matter of law, from considering events which occurred after the lien date in assessing properties and subsequent events assessing officials may consider in any individual case will depend on the nature of the event and the weight to be given the event will depend upon its reliability in tending to show value as of January 1. (See Application of Rosewell, 120 Ill. App. 3d 369 (1st Dist. 1983)).

The Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$250,000 as of the assessment date at issue. Since market value has been established the 2011 three year average median level of assessments for Kane County of 33.23% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue shall apply. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(1)).

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Ronald R. Crit

Chairman

K. L. Fan

Member

Richard A. Huff

Member

Mario M. Lino

Member

J. R.

Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: November 21, 2014

Allen Castrovillari

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.