



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Linda Tetreault
DOCKET NO.: 11-02458.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 08-17-409-001

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Linda Tetreault, the appellant, and the DuPage County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the DuPage County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$54,720
IMPR: \$48,708
TOTAL: \$103,428

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

ANALYSIS

The subject property is improved with a frame dwelling that contains 2,195 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1972. Features of the home include a partial unfinished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and an attached garage of 462 square feet of building area. The property is located in Naperville, Lisle Township, DuPage County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on September 9, 2010 for a price of \$312,000. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the appeal disclosing the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was purchased from Walter Stranczek and sold using a Realtor from the Weichert firm, agent Tobin Siefert. The property had been advertised on the open market with the Multiple Listing Service and it had been on the market for 126 days. In further support of the transaction the appellant submitted a copy of the Settlement Statement which

reiterated the purchase date and sales price previously reported.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeals" wherein the subject's total assessment of \$122,850 was disclosed. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$370,588 or \$168.83 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2011 three year average median level of assessment for DuPage County of 33.15% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of the assessment the board of review submitted its Addendum to Board of Review Notes on Appeal along with Exhibit 1 consisting of a spreadsheet containing seven comparable sales. The spreadsheet indicates it was prepared by John D. Trowbridge II, Lisle Township Assessor and includes a map depicting the location of the subject and comparable properties. The grid also depicts the subject's date of purchase of September 2010 and purchase price of \$312,000.

The comparable sales are improved with one-story dwellings, three of which are located in the same neighborhood code assigned by the assessor as the subject property. The comparable dwellings consist of frame construction and range in size from 1,997 to 2,498 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed from 1966 to 1977. Features of the comparables include a full or partial unfinished basement. Five of the comparables have central air conditioning. Each has a fireplace and an attached garage ranging in size from 462 to 528 square feet of building area. These seven comparables sold from June 1984 to August 2009 for prices ranging from \$135,000 to \$480,000 or from \$58.33 to \$192.15 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

After reviewing the record and considering the evidence, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal. The Board further finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. Except in counties with more than 200,000 inhabitants that classify

property, property is to be valued at 33 1/3% of fair cash value. (35 ILCS 200/9-145(a)). Fair cash value is defined in the Property Tax Code as "[t]he amount for which a property can be sold in the due course of business and trade, not under duress, between a willing buyer and a willing seller." (35 ILCS 200/1-50). The Supreme Court of Illinois has construed "fair cash value" to mean what the property would bring at a voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is ready, willing, and able to buy but not forced to do so. Springfield Marine Bank v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 44 Ill.2d 428 (1970). A contemporaneous sale between two parties dealing at arm's length is not only relevant to the question of fair cash value but practically conclusive on the issue on whether the assessment is reflective of market value. Korzen v. Belt Railway Co. of Chicago, 37 Ill.2d 158 (1967). When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. National City Bank of Michigan/Illinois v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 331 Ill.App.3d 1038 (3rd Dist. 2002); 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c)). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property on September 9, 2010 for a price of \$312,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length transaction. The parties to the transaction were not related, the property was purchased from Walter Stranczek and sold using a Realtor from the Weichert firm, agent Tobin Siefert. The property had been advertised on the open market with the Multiple Listing Service and it had been on the market for 126 days prior to the sale. The sale occurred approximately three months prior to the assessment date of January 1, 2011 which makes it proximate in time to the assessment date.

Furthermore, the Board finds the purchase price of \$312,000 is below the market value reflected by the assessment of \$370,588. Additionally, the Board finds the board of review did not present any evidence to challenge the arm's length nature of the transaction and, in fact, reported the sale of the subject in September 2010 for \$312,000 in its own analysis.

There was also no evidence from the board of review to refute the contention that the purchase price was reflective of market value at the time of sale. In light of the provisions of the Property Tax Code and the applicable case law, the Board has given reduced weight to the comparable sales presented by the board of review in order to support the subject's assessment. Comparables #5, #7 and #8 sold between June 1984 and July 1993 and are too remote in time to be indicative of the subject's estimated market value as of January 1, 2011. The remaining comparable sales #1 through #4 similarly sold in 2009 or a date more distant in time from the assessment date of January 1, 2011 than the sale of the subject which occurred in September 2010.

Based on this record the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$312,000 as of January 1, 2011. Since market value has been determined the 2011 three year average median level of assessment for DuPage County of 33.15% shall apply. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(1)).

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Ronald R. Cuit

Chairman

K. L. Fern

Member

Member

Mario Morris

Member

J. R.

Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: April 18, 2014

Allen Castrovillari

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.