



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION  
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Mohsin Sheikh  
DOCKET NO.: 09-34880.001-R-1  
PARCEL NO.: 30-20-411-046-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Mohsin Sheikh, the appellant, by attorney Donald L. Schramm of Rieff Schramm Kanter & Guttman in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **no change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND: \$1,535**  
**IMPR.: \$8,899**  
**TOTAL: \$10,434**

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

**ANALYSIS**

**Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2009 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

**Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a one and one-half story dwelling of frame and masonry construction. The dwelling is approximately 57 years old and has 1,109 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a full finished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a two-car garage. The property has a 4,725 square foot site and is located in Calumet City, Thornton Township, Cook County. The subject is classified

as a class 2-03 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on November 21, 2008 for a price of \$32,745. The appellant submitted a copy of the settlement statement to document the subject's sale. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$10,434. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$117,236 or \$105.71 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2009 three year average median level of assessments for class 2 property of 8.90% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted two grid analyses with information on eight comparable properties, four of which were sales. Board of review analyst Gabriela Nicolau also submitted a brief challenging the arm's length nature of the subject's sale. The board of review analyst submitted a print-out of the subject property's deed history from the Cook County Recorder of Deeds' website. This print-out revealed that the subject's November 2008 sale was compulsory due to foreclosure.

The appellant's attorney submitted a rebuttal brief.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

In this appeal, the Board finds that the board of review successfully challenged the arm's length nature of the subject's

sale and presented comparable sales to refute the appellant's contention that the subject's sale price was reflective of market value. The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be board of review comparable sales #5-#7. These comparables were very similar to the subject in location, age, living area, and foundation. These properties also sold proximate in time to the January 1, 2009 assessment date. Comparables #5-#7 sold from April to November 2008 for prices ranging from \$125,000 to \$136,000 or from \$107.20 to \$116.24 per square foot of living area, land included. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$117,236 or \$105.71 per square foot of living area, land included, which is below the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. The Board gave no weight to the subject's sale. The appellant did not complete section IV of the residential appeal form and did not demonstrate that the subject's sale met the key elements of an arm's length transaction. Based on this record the Board finds the subject's assessment is reflective of market value and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

*Ronald R. Cuit*

Chairman

*K. L. Fern*

Member

*Tracy A. Huff*

Member

*Mario Morris*

Member

*J.R.*

Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: May 21, 2014

*Allen Castrovillari*

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.