FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: John & Laura Mulvenna
DOCKET NO.: 09-31544.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 23-06-104-007-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are John & Laura Mulvenna, the appellants, by attorney Brian P. Liston, of the Law Offices of Liston & Tsantilis, P.C. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **no change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	$ 11,610
IMPR.:	$ 59,080
TOTAL:	$ 70,690

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

ANALYSIS

The subject property is improved with a two-story dwelling of frame construction. The dwelling is eight years old and contains 3,168 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a full finished basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces, and a three-car garage. The subject is located in Willow Springs, Lyons Township, Cook County.

The appellants' appeal is based on unequal treatment in the assessment process. The appellants submitted information on three suggested comparable properties described as two-story dwellings of frame or masonry construction. The comparable properties have the same assigned neighborhood code as the subject. The comparable dwellings are either seven or nine years old and contain from 3,168 to 3,378 square feet of living area. Each comparable has a full basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces, and a garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from $51,579 to $60,810 or from $15.63 to $18.41 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment is $59,080 or $18.65 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellants requested that the subject's improvement assessment be reduced to $54,950 or $17.35 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" wherein the subject's final assessment of $70,690 was disclosed. The board of review presented descriptions and assessment information on four suggested comparable properties consisting of two-story dwellings of frame or frame and masonry construction. The comparable properties have the same assigned neighborhood code as the subject. The dwellings are either four or seven years old and contain either 3,168 or 3,189 square feet of living area. Each comparable has a full basement, central air conditioning, one or two fireplaces, and a garage. These properties have improvement assessments ranging from $59,459 to $61,215 or from $18.77 to $19.20 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

After reviewing the record and considering the evidence, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal. The Board further finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The appellants contend unequal treatment in the subject's improvement assessment as the basis of the appeal. Taxpayers who object to an assessment on the basis of lack of uniformity bear the burden of proving the disparity of assessment valuations by clear and convincing evidence. Kankakee County Board of Review v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 131 Ill.2d 1 (1989). After an analysis of the assessment data, the Board finds the appellants have not met this burden.

Both parties presented assessment data on a total of seven suggested comparables. All of the comparables submitted were very similar to the subject in almost all respects; however, the Board finds the appellants' comparable #2 and the board of review comparables #1 through #3 were identical to the subject in size. Due to their similarities to the subject, these four comparables received the most weight in the Board's analysis. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from $58,319 to $60,492 or from $18.41 to $19.09 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of $59,080 or $18.65 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the most similar comparables. After considering adjustments and the differences in both parties' comparables when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's improvement assessment is equitable and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Chairman

Member

Member

Member

Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: July 19, 2013

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing

complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board’s decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.