



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Chris Kendall
DOCKET NO.: 09-30008.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 17-06-327-045-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Chris Kendall, the appellant, by attorney Timothy C. Jacobs of Gary H. Smith PC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$8,486
IMPR.: \$14,654
TOTAL: \$23,140

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

ANALYSIS

The subject property is improved with a one and one-half story dwelling of frame and masonry construction. The dwelling is approximately 116 years old and has 1,979 square feet of living area.¹ Features of the home include an unfinished basement and central air conditioning. The property has a 2,496 square foot site and is located in Chicago, West Chicago Township, Cook County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. The appellant disclosed that the subject property sold in July 2009 for \$215,000 or for \$108.64 per square foot of living area, land included. In section 2d of the residential appeal form, the appellant indicated that the appeal was being based not on a recent sale but on a recent appraisal. In support of the overvaluation argument, the appellant submitted an appraisal

¹ Parties differed on size. Given the record, the appraiser's data is accepted as having better support.

estimating the subject property had a market value of \$260,000 or \$131.38 per square foot of living area, land included, as of June 2, 2009. The appraisal was prepared by Frank Girolamo, a State of Illinois certified real estate appraiser. In estimating the market value of the subject property, the appraiser developed only the sales comparison approach to value.

Using the sales comparison approach, the appraiser provided information on four comparable sales and two active listings. The comparable properties are described as one and one-half or two-story dwellings of masonry, frame, or frame and masonry construction. The comparables range in age from eight to 125 years and contain from 900 to 1,584 square feet of living area. Each comparable has a basement; three comparables have central air conditioning; and two comparables have garages. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 1,675 to 3,024 square feet of land area. The four comparable sales sold from September 2008 to May 2009 for prices ranging from \$230,000 to \$344,900 or from \$169.92 to \$261.11 per square foot of living area, including land. The two comparables that had not yet sold were listed for \$249,900 and \$285,000 or for \$170.93 and \$182.46 per square foot of living area, including land, respectively. After making adjustments to the comparables for differences from the subject, the appraiser estimated the comparables had adjusted prices ranging from \$240,500 to \$296,800 or from \$164.50 to \$271.67 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this data, the appraiser estimated the subject had an estimated value under the sales comparison approach of \$260,000.

The appraiser estimated the subject property had a market value of \$260,000 as of June 2, 2009. Based on this evidence, the appellant's attorney requested that subject's assessment be calculated by applying the 10% median level of assessments for Class 2 residential property in Cook County to the estimate of market value contained in the appraisal report. Based on this record, counsel requested the subject's total assessment be reduced to \$26,000.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" wherein the subject's total assessment of \$43,549 was disclosed. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$489,315 or \$247.25 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2009 three year average median level of assessments for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 8.90% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

The board of review presented descriptions and assessment information on four equity properties and provided a sale price for one of these comparables. The comparable that sold is described as a one and one-half story dwelling with masonry exterior construction. This comparable dwelling is approximately 101 years old and has 1,305 square feet of living area. This dwelling has a full finished basement. This comparable sold in July 2006 for \$532,500 or for \$408.05 per square foot of living area, land included. The board of review also provided a list of twenty properties that sold from September 1990 to July 2009 for prices that ranged from \$110,000 to \$440,000. Included in this list was the sale of the subject property in July 2009 for \$215,000 or for \$108.64 per square foot of living area, land included. Descriptive evidence for the other sale properties was not provided. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

After reviewing the record and considering the evidence, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal. The Board further finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. National City Bank of Michigan/Illinois v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 331 Ill.App.3d 1038 (3rd Dist. 2002); 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c)). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the appellant's appraisal report is the best evidence of the subject's market value as of the January 1, 2009 assessment date. The appraiser estimated a market value of \$260,000 or \$131.38 per square foot of living area, land included, for the subject property as of June 2, 2009. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$489,315 or \$247.25 per square foot of living area, land included, using the 2009 three year median level of assessments for Class 2 property in Cook County of 8.90% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(2)). The subject's

market value as reflected by its assessment is in excess of the market value estimate contained in the appraisal report.

The Board finds that the board of review did not address or refute the appellant's overvaluation argument. The board of review presented four equity comparables and provided a sale price for one of these comparables. However, this sale occurred in July 2006, which was not as proximate in time to the January 1, 2009 assessment date as the comparable sales utilized in the appraisal report.

Based on this record, the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$260,000 as of January 1, 2009. Since market value has been determined, the 2009 three year average median level of assessments for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 8.90% shall apply. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(2)).

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: March 21, 2014



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.