



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Scott Carr
DOCKET NO.: 09-29480.001-R-1 through 09-29480.002-R-1
PARCEL NO.: See Below

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Scott Carr, the appellant, by attorney Mitchell L. Klein of Schiller Klein PC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

DOCKET NO	PARCEL NUMBER	LAND	IMPRVMT	TOTAL
09-29480.001-R-1	05-17-118-065-0000	19,201	56,670	\$75,871
09-29480.002-R-1	05-17-118-066-0000	6,046	0	\$6,046

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

ANALYSIS

The subject property consists of two parcels. Parcel #1 has approximately 6,576 square feet of land area and is improved with a two-story dwelling of frame and masonry construction. The dwelling is approximately 61 years old and contains 1,764 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a partial finished basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces, and a two-car garage. Parcel #2 is an unimproved lot with approximately 3,295 square feet of land area.¹ The

¹ The appellant's appraiser combined the subject's two parcels and listed the subject's land area as 9,871 square feet. According to the board of review, parcel #1 has a land area of 6,576 square feet. The board of review did not provide the property characteristic sheet for parcel #2. Parcel #2's land area was obtained by subtracting 6,576 from 9,871.

subject property is located in Winnetka, New Trier Township, Cook County.

Parcel #1 has an owner occupied residence that was the subject matter of appeals before the Property Tax Appeal Board for the prior years under docket numbers 07-20909.001-R-1 and 08-30265.001-R-1. In those appeals the Property Tax Appeal Board rendered decisions lowering the assessment of the subject's parcel #1 to \$75,871 based upon the evidence submitted by the parties. The subject's parcel #2 was not part of the earlier appeals.

The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that 2007, 2008, and 2009 are within the same general assessment period for residential property in New Trier Township. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.90(i)).

For the 2009 appeal, the appellant submitted an appraisal to demonstrate the subject property was overvalued. The appraiser concluded that the subject property, including both parcels, had a market value of \$785,000 as of January 1, 2009.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" wherein the final assessment of parcel #1 totaling \$84,076 was disclosed. The board of review did not disclose the final assessment of parcel #2; however, a copy of the decision issued by the board of review submitted by the appellant disclosed this parcel had an assessment of \$6,046. The combined assessment totaling \$90,122 reflects a fair market value of \$1,012,607 using the 2009 three year average median level of assessments for class 2 property in Cook County of 8.90% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue. (86 Ill.Admin.Code 1910.50(c)(2)). The board of review submitted descriptions and assessment information on four equity comparables to demonstrate the subject's improvement was being assessed uniformly; however, the board of review did not address the appellant's market value argument.

After reviewing the record and considering the evidence, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal. Pursuant to section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-185), the Board finds the prior year decisions should be carried forward to the subsequent year subject only to equalization.

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-185) provides in part:

If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel on which a residence occupied by the owner is situated, such reduced assessment, subject to equalization, shall remain in effect for the remainder of the general assessment period as provided in Sections 9-215 through 9-225, unless that parcel is subsequently sold in an arm's length transaction establishing a fair cash value for the parcel that is different from the fair cash value on which the Board's assessment is based, or unless the decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board is reversed or modified upon review.

The Property Tax Appeal Board takes notice that decisions reducing parcel #1's 2007 and 2008 assessments have been issued. The record further indicates that the subject's parcel #1 is an owner occupied dwelling and that 2007, 2008 and 2009 are within the same general assessment period for New Trier Township. The record contains no evidence indicating the subject property sold in an arm's length transaction subsequent to the Board's decision or that the decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board for the previous tax years had been reversed or modified upon review. For these reasons the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that a reduction in parcel #1's assessment is warranted to reflect the Board's prior year's decisions plus the application of an equalization factor, if any. The Board finds that no change in the assessment of parcel #2 is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: February 21, 2014



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.