



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Mark Battista
DOCKET NO.: 09-28186.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 02-18-201-010-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Mark Battista, the appellant, by attorney Thomas M. Battista of Law Offices of Thomas M. Battista in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds no change in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND: \$7,645
IMPR.: \$68,221
TOTAL: \$75,866**

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

ANALYSIS

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2009 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of masonry construction. The dwelling is approximately 15 years old and has 4,326 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a full finished basement, central air conditioning, a

fireplace and a three-car garage. The property has a 43,691 square foot site and is located in Inverness, Palatine Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-08 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on three equity comparables.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$75,866. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$68,221 or \$15.77 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three equity comparables; however, board of review comparable #2 is the same property as the appellant's comparable #1.

The appellant's attorney submitted a rebuttal brief in response to the board of review's evidence. Counsel also submitted an appraisal, wherein the appraiser estimated the subject property had a market value of \$560,000 as of January 1, 2010.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant's attorney submitted a rebuttal brief with new evidence for this appeal. Section 1910.66(c) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board provides that rebuttal evidence shall not consist of new evidence such as an appraisal or newly discovered comparable properties. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.66(c). Pursuant to section 1910.66(c) of the Property Tax Appeal Board, the Board finds it cannot consider this new evidence in determining the correct assessment of the subject property.

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and

a reduction in the subject's assessment based on inequity is not warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be appellant's comparable #2 and board of review comparable #1. These comparables had improvement assessments of \$14.91 and \$15.90 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$15.77 per square foot of living area falls between the improvement assessments of the best comparables in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment based on inequity is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Ronald R. Cuit

Chairman

K. L. Fern

Member

Tracy A. Huff

Member

Mario Morris

Member

J. R.

Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: May 21, 2014

Allen Castrovillari

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.