



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION  
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Andy Schcolnik  
DOCKET NO.: 09-27751.001-R-1  
PARCEL NO.: 20-27-421-041-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Andy Schcolnik, the appellant, by attorney David C. Dunkin of Arnstein & Lehr, LLP in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:       \$850  
IMPR.:       \$850  
TOTAL:      \$1,700**

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

**Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2009 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

**Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story, multi-family dwelling of masonry construction with 1,464 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 96 years old. Features include two apartment units and a full unfinished basement. The property has a 4,375 square foot site and is located in Chicago, Hyde Park Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on July 24, 2009, for a price of \$17,000. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$15,410. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$173,146 or \$118.27 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2009 three year average median level of assessments for class 2 property of 8.9% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

With its "Notes on Appeal," the board of review submitted information on four comparable properties, one of which was a sale. Comparable #1 sold in January 2008 for a price of \$99,000. The board of review also made reference to an earlier sale of the subject property. The subject sold in July 2006 for a price of \$142,000. With its "Analysis/Evidence Sheet," the board of review presented a sale price for another comparable property. Comparable #3 sold in April 2006 for a price of \$270,000. The board of review also presented evidence that indicated that the subject's July 2009 sale was compulsory due to foreclosure. This evidence consisted of print-outs of the subject property's deed history from the Cook County Recorder of Deeds' website. Based on this information, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

The appellant's attorney submitted a rebuttal brief.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in July 2009 for a price of

\$18,375. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had many of the elements of an arm's length transaction. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the appeal disclosing the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was sold using a realtor, and the property had been advertised on the open market with the Multiple Listing Service. In further support of the transaction, the appellant submitted copies of the settlement statement, the warranty deed and the MLS listing sheet. The listing sheet revealed that the subject was first listed for sale at \$29,900 before it sold for \$17,000. The Board finds the purchase price is below the market value reflected by the assessment.

The Board finds the board of review presented evidence to challenge the arm's length nature of the transaction but was not able to refute the contention that the purchase price was reflective of market value. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$173,146. The sale price of board of review comparable #2 ("Notes on Appeal") was significantly less than this estimate of market value. Although board of review comparable #3 ("Analysis/Evidence Sheet) sold in April 2006 for \$270,000, this comparable had 50% more living area than the subject property, and its sale date was not as proximate to the assessment date at issue as the subject's July 2009 sale date. Consequently, the Board gave the board of review's market evidence little weight.

Based on this record, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment commensurate with the appellant's request is appropriate.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

*Ronald R. Crit*

Chairman

*K. L. Fan*

Member

*Richard A. Huff*

Member

*Mario M. Lino*

Member

*J. R.*

Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: March 20, 2015

*A. Portol*

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.