



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Toby Pena
DOCKET NO.: 09-24831.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 13-09-431-055-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Toby Pena, the appellant, by attorney Christopher G. Walsh, Jr. in Chicago, and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds no change in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$5,019
IMPR.: \$47,905
TOTAL: \$52,924

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

ANALYSIS

The subject property is improved with a two-story dwelling of masonry construction containing 2,142 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 7 years old. Features of the home include a full finished basement and a two-car detached garage.

The appellant's appeal is based on unequal treatment in the assessment process. The appellant submitted information on four comparable properties described as two-story masonry dwellings that range in age from 49 to 59 years old. The comparable dwellings range in size from 2,152 to 2,208 square feet of living area. Features include full basements, one of which is finished with a recreation room. Two of the comparables have finished living area in the attic and two have central air conditioning. Three comparables have two-car detached garages and the fourth comparable has a one-car detached garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$39,578 to \$40,829 or from \$18.24 to \$18.49 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment is \$22.36 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's improvement assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" wherein the subject's final assessment was disclosed. The board of review presented descriptions and assessment

information on four comparable properties consisting of two-story masonry or frame and masonry dwellings that range in age from 3 to 6 years old. The dwellings range in size from 2,432 to 2,511 square feet of living area. Features include full basements, central air conditioning and fireplaces. Three of the comparables have finished recreation rooms in the basement. Garages are either 2-car or 2.5-car. These properties have improvement assessments ranging from \$52,410 to \$58,292 or from \$21.55 to \$23.21 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

After reviewing the record and considering the evidence, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal. The Board further finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The appellant contends unequal treatment in the subject's improvement assessment as the basis of the appeal. Taxpayers who object to an assessment on the basis of lack of uniformity bear the burden of proving the disparity of assessment valuations by clear and convincing evidence. Kankakee County Board of Review v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 131 Ill.2d 1 (1989). After an analysis of the assessment data, the Board finds the appellant has not met this burden.

The Property Tax Appeal Board gives little weight to all four of the comparables submitted by the appellant. The Board finds that the properties are too dissimilar to the subject in age to provide an accurate indication of assessment equity. The subject is just 7 years old while the four comparables range in age from 49 to 59 years. Age alone would justify the subject's higher assessment.

The Board finds the comparables submitted by the board of review were most similar to the subject in location, style, exterior construction, features and age. Due to their similarities to the subject, these comparables received the most weight in the Board's analysis. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$21.55 to \$23.21 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$22.36 per square foot of living area is within the range established by the most similar comparables.

After considering adjustments and the differences in both parties' comparables when compared to the subject, the Board finds that the appellant has failed to prove with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement assessment is not equitable. Therefore, the Board finds that a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Ronald R. Cuit

Chairman

K. L. Fern

Member

Frank A. Huff

Member

Mario Morris

Member

J. R.

Member

DISSENTING: _____

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: February 22, 2013

Allen Castrovillari

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing

complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.