



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Rick Haljean
DOCKET NO.: 09-23779.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 13-17-309-076-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Rick Haljean, the appellant, by attorney Brian P. Liston of the Law Offices of Liston & Tsantilis, P.C. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$8,996
IMPR.: \$24,804
TOTAL: \$33,800

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2009 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story multi-family building of frame construction with 3,447 square feet of building area. The building is approximately 101 years old and has three units. Features of the property include a full basement finished with an apartment and a one-car detached garage. The property has a 6,426 square foot site and is

located in Chicago, Jefferson Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on four comparable sales. The comparables were improved with multi-family buildings that ranged in size from 2,416 to 2,806 square feet of building area. These buildings ranged in age from 89 to 103 years and had two or four units. The sales occurred from May 2009 to December 2009 for prices ranging from \$145,000 to \$265,000 or from \$51.67 to \$98.10 per square foot of building area or from \$36,250 to \$132,500 per unit, land included. The appellant requested the subject's assessment be reduced to \$28,610.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$36,693. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$366,930 or \$106.45 per square foot of building area and \$122,310 per unit, including land, when applying the 10% level of assessment for class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparables, three of which sold. The comparables that sold were improved with two-story multi-family buildings that ranged in size from 3,258 to 3,308 square feet of building area. These properties ranged in age from 85 to 98 years old and had from 2 to 5 units. The sales occurred from June 2006 to March 2007 for prices ranging from \$50,000 to \$399,000 or from \$15.15 to \$120.62 per square foot of building area or from \$16,667 to \$180,000 per unit, land included.

The board of review also submitted a list of twenty sales of class 2-11 properties located in the subject's neighborhood. The sales occurred from January 1992 to September 2006.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale,

comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be appellant's comparable sales #1 through #3. These comparables sold for prices ranging from \$88.40 to \$98.10 per square foot of building area or from \$110,500 to \$132,500 per unit, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$366,930 or \$106.45 per square foot of building area and \$122,310 per unit, including land, which is above the range established by the best comparable sales on a square foot basis and above the price per unit of two of the three comparables. The Board gives little weight to appellant's comparable sale #4 that sold for \$51.67 per square foot of building area or \$36,250 per unit, including land, as it appears to be an outlier compared to the best sales. The Board gave less weight to the board of review three sales due to the fact they did not sell as proximate in time to the assessment date as did the best sales presented by the appellant. The Board gave little weight to the board of review's assessment equity analysis because this did not address the appellant's market value argument. The Board also gave little weight to the list of twenty sales submitted by the board of review due to the dates of sale and the lack of any descriptive data that precludes a meaningful comparative analysis. Based on this evidence the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Ronald R. Crit

Chairman

K. L. F...

Member

Richard A. ...

Member

Mark ...

Member

J.R.

Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: September 19, 2014

Allen Castrovillari

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.