



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Virginia Calvin
DOCKET NO.: 09-23656.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 31-03-215-008-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Virginia Calvin, the appellant(s), by attorney Richard H. Levy, of Fisk Kart Katz and Regan, Ltd. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 2,752
IMPR.: \$ 7,439
TOTAL: \$ 10,191

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2009 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board (the "Board") finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject consists of a two-story dwelling of frame and masonry construction with 2,979 square feet of living area. The dwelling is seven years old. Features of the home include two and one-half baths, a full unfinished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace, and a three-car garage. The property has a 9,175 square foot site, and is located in Rich Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-78 property

under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on December 16, 2009 for a price of \$114,500 pursuant to a foreclosure. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price. The appellant also submitted information on four comparable sales.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$26,822. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$301,371, or \$101.17 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2009 three year average median level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 8.90% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables. The board of review also submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on February 1, 2007 for a price of \$420,000. The board of review also submitted information on two comparable sales.

In rebuttal, the appellant submitted an appraisal for the subject.

Conclusion of Law

Initially, the Board finds that the appraisal submitted by the appellant in rebuttal evidence cannot be considered. "Rebuttal evidence shall not consist of new evidence such as an appraisal or newly discovered comparable properties. A party to the appeal shall be precluded from submitting its own case in chief in the guise of rebuttal evidence." 86 Ill.Admin.Code § 1910.66(c).

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code

§1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in December 2009 for a price of \$114,500. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length transaction. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the appeal disclosing the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was sold using a Realtor, the property had been advertised on the open market with a listing on the MLS, and it had been on the market for 21 days. In further support of the transaction, the appellant submitted a copy of the sales contract, the settlement statement, and a printout from the MLS. Moreover, the appellant provided sales comparables which support the subject's sale price. The Board finds the purchase price is below the market value reflected by the assessment. The Board finds the board of review did not present any evidence to challenge the arm's length nature of the transaction or to refute the contention that the purchase price was reflective of market value. Based on this record the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$114,500 as of January 1, 2009. Since market value has been determined the 2009 three year average median level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 8.90% shall apply. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(2).

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING:

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: December 19, 2014



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.