



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Robert Dumelle
DOCKET NO.: 07-23047.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 09-26-101-014-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Robert Dumelle, the appellant(s); and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$8,640
IMPR.: \$23,488
TOTAL: \$32,128

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

ANALYSIS

The subject property consists of a 6,750 square foot parcel of land improved with a 54-year old, one-story, frame, single-family dwelling containing 1,226 square feet of living area, one bath, air conditioning, and a full, unfinished basement. The appellant, via counsel, argued that the fair market value of the subject was not accurately reflected in its assessed value.

In support of the market value argument, the appellant submitted an appraisal authored by Hal London. The report indicates London is a State of Illinois certified general appraiser. The appraiser indicated the subject has an estimated market value of \$320,000 as of February 18, 2004. The appraisal report utilized the cost and the sales comparison approaches to value to estimate the market value for the subject property.

Under the cost approach, the appraiser estimated a site value of \$300,000. He then valued the improvements at \$128,655 and deducted depreciation at \$94,200 to arrive at a cost of \$34,455. With site improvements and the value of the land add, the

appraiser estimated the value of the subject under this approach at \$337,500.

Under the sales comparison approach, the appraiser analyzed the sales of four properties located within the subject's market. The comparables are one-story, masonry or frame, single-family dwellings. The properties contain from 1,146 to 1,362 square feet of living area and sold from June 2003 to January 2004 for prices ranging from \$315,000 to \$354,600, or from \$252.21 to \$279.40 per square foot of living area, including land. The appraiser adjusted each of the comparables for pertinent factors. Based on the similarities and difference of the comparables when compared to the subject, the appraiser estimated a value for the subject of \$320,000.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" wherein the subject's final assessment of \$37,953 was disclosed. This assessment reflects a market value of \$378,018 using the Illinois Department of Revenue's 2007 three year median level of assessment of 10.04% for Cook County Class 2 property. In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review presented descriptions and assessment information on a total of four properties suggested as comparable and located within the subject's neighborhood. The properties are described as one-story, frame, single-family dwellings with one or one and one-half baths, a fireplace for two properties, air conditioning for one property, and, for three properties, a full, unfinished basement. The properties range: in age from 44 to 57 years; in size from 1,157 to 1,246 square feet of living area; and in improvement assessment from \$23.93 to \$26.84 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

After reviewing the record and considering the evidence, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal. The Board further finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

When overvaluation is claimed the appellant has the burden of proving the value of the property by a preponderance of the evidence. National City Bank of Michigan/Illinois v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 331 Ill.App.3d 1038 (3rd Dist. 2002); Winnebago County Board of Review v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 313 Ill.App.3d 179 (2nd Dist. 2000). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal, a recent arm's length sale of the subject property, recent sales of comparable properties, or recent construction costs of the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code 1910.65(c). Having considered the evidence presented, the PTAB concludes that the evidence indicates a reduction is warranted.

In determining the fair market value of the subject property, the PTAB finds the best evidence to be the appellant's appraisal. The appellant's appraiser utilized the cost and the sales comparison approaches to value in determining the subject's market value.

The PTAB finds this appraisal to be persuasive for the appraiser: has experience in appraising; personally inspected the subject property and reviewed the property's history; and used similar properties in the sales comparison approach while providing sufficient detail regarding each sale as well as adjustments that were necessary.

The PTAB gives little weight to the board of review's comparables as no market value information was provided.

Therefore, the PTAB finds that the subject property had a market value of \$320,000 for the 2007 assessment year. Since the market value of the subject has been established, the Illinois Department of Revenue's 2007 three year median level of assessment of 10.04% for Cook County Class 2 property will apply. In applying this level of assessment to the subject, the total assessed value is \$32,128 while the subject's current total assessed value is above this amount. Therefore, the PTAB finds that a reduction is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Ronald R. Cuit

Chairman

K. L. Fern

Member

Frank A. Huff

Member

Mario Morris

Member

Shawn R. Lerbis

Member

DISSENTING: _____

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: February 18, 2011

Allen Castrovillari

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing

complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.