



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: John Oshana
DOCKET NO.: 06-24954.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 14-29-106-020-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are John Oshana, the appellant, by attorney Howard W. Melton, of Howard W. Melton and Associates in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds no change in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$14,404
IMPR.: \$74,666
TOTAL: \$89,070

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

ANALYSIS

The subject property is improved with two dwellings on the same parcel. Building 1 is a 2-story multi-family dwelling of frame construction containing 2,478 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 128 years old and features a full, unfinished basement. Building 2 is a 2-story multi-family frame dwelling 109 years old with a full, unfinished basement. It contains 1,628 square feet of living area.

The appellant's appeal is based on unequal treatment in the assessment process. The appellant submitted information on four comparable properties described as 2-story frame or masonry dwellings that range in age from 88 to 130 years old. The comparable dwellings range in size from 2,829 to 3,150 square feet of living area. All comparables feature full or partial basements one of which is finished. All have 2-car garages. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$19.01 to \$21.60 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement

assessment for building 1 is \$20.78¹ per square foot of living area, and \$14.24 per square foot of living area for building 2. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's improvement assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" wherein the subject's final assessment was disclosed. The board of review presented descriptions and assessment information on six comparable properties consisting of 2 or 3-story frame dwellings that range in age from 117 to 125 years old. The dwellings range in size from 2,310 to 2,680 square feet of living area. All comparables feature full basements of which one was finished². Five of the comparables have 2 or 2½-car garages. These properties have improvement assessments ranging from \$20.79 to \$23.12 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

After reviewing the record and considering the evidence, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal. The Board further finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The appellant contends unequal treatment in the subject's improvement assessment as the basis of the appeal. Taxpayers who object to an assessment on the basis of lack of uniformity bear the burden of proving the disparity of assessment valuations by clear and convincing evidence. Kankakee County Board of Review v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 131 Ill.2d 1 (1989). After an analysis of the assessment data, the Board finds the appellant has not met this burden.

Comparables #1 and #4 submitted by the appellant were masonry dwellings, and comparable #5 submitted by the board of review was a 3-story building. These three comparables received less weight in the Board's analysis. The Board finds comparables #2 and #3 submitted by the appellant and comparables #1, #2, #3, #4 and #6 submitted by the board of review were most similar to the subject in size, style, external construction, features and age. Due to their similarities to the subject, these comparables received the most weight in the Board's analysis. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$19.82 to \$23.12 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment for building 1 of \$20.78 per square foot of living area is within the range established by the most similar comparables. After considering adjustments and the differences in both parties'

¹ The appellant used the improvement assessments for both buildings, but only used the square footage from building 1. This resulted in an erroneous improvement assessment of \$30.13 per square foot of living area. The correct improvement assessment for building 1 is \$20.78 per square foot of living area, and for building 2 is \$14.24 per square foot of living area.

² Board of review comparable #2 was incorrectly listed as unfinished, but is described as finished apartment on the property characteristic sheet.

comparables when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's improvement assessment for building 1 is equitable and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted. The appellant did not contest the assessment of building 2, and therefore the Board finds the improvement assessment of building 2 is equitable and no change in assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Ronald R. Cuit

Chairman

K. L. Fern

Member

Frank A. Huff

Member

Mario M. Louie

Member

Shawn R. Lerski

Member

DISSENTING: _____

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: December 3, 2010

Allen Castrovillari

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing

complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.