

PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD'S DECISION

APPELLANT: James Findlay
DOCKET NO.: 05-23180.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 04-14-200-121-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are James Findlay, the appellant, by attorney Mitchell L. Klein of Schiller, Klein & McElroy, P.C., Chicago, and the Cook County Board of Review.

The subject property consists of a 71-year-old, two-story, single-family dwelling of frame and masonry construction containing 3,461 square feet of living area and located in Northfield Township, Cook County. Features of the residence include three and one-half bathrooms, a partial-unfinished basement, a fireplace and a two and one-half car attached garage.

The appellant, through counsel, submitted evidence before the Property Tax Appeal Board arguing unequal treatment in the assessment process of the improvement as the basis of the appeal. In support of this claim, the appellant submitted assessment data and descriptive information on three properties suggested as comparable to the subject. The appellant also submitted a one-page brief as well as a copy of the board of review's decision. Based on the appellant's documents, the three suggested comparables consist of two-story, single-family dwellings of frame, masonry or frame and masonry construction located within the subject's neighborhood. The improvements range in size from 3,901 to 4,253 square feet of living area and range in age from 72 to 80 years. The comparables contain from three and one-half to four and one-half bathrooms, from one to three fireplaces and a two-car garage. Two comparables contain an unfinished basement and two comparables have air-conditioning. The improvement assessments range from \$16.82 to \$17.49 per square foot of living area. Based on the evidence submitted, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's improvement assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the subject's total assessment of \$82,325. The subject's improvement assessment is \$63,294 or \$18.29 per

(Continued on Next Page)

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds no change in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 19,031
IMPR.: \$ 63,294
TOTAL: \$ 82,325

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

square foot of living area. In support of the assessment the board submitted property characteristic printouts and descriptive data on three properties suggested as comparable to the subject. The suggested comparables are improved with two-story, single-family dwellings of masonry or frame and masonry construction with the same neighborhood code as the subject. The improvements range in size from 2,504 to 5,291 square feet of living area and range in age from 36 to 81 years. The comparables contain two and one-half or three and one-half bathrooms, fireplaces and a multi-car garage. One comparable has an unfinished basement and air-conditioning. The improvement assessments range from \$20.14 to \$23.93 per square foot of living area.

In rebuttal, the appellant's attorney submitted a two-page letter highlighting various differences between the subject and the board of review's comparables.

After reviewing the record and considering the evidence, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal. The appellant's argument was unequal treatment in the assessment process. The Illinois Supreme Court has held that taxpayers who object to an assessment on the basis of lack of uniformity bear the burden of proving the disparity of assessment valuations by clear and convincing evidence. Kankakee County Board of Review V. Property Tax Appeal Board, 131 Ill.2d 1 (1989). The evidence must demonstrate a consistent pattern of assessment inequities within the assessment jurisdiction. After an analysis of the assessment data, the Board finds the appellant has not overcome this burden.

Both parties submitted a total of six properties similar to the subject in location, design and amenities but with many variations in living area, age and/or exterior construction. These six properties have improvement assessments ranging from \$16.82 to \$23.93 per square foot of living area. The subject's per square foot improvement assessment of \$18.29 falls within the range established by these properties. However, along with other differences, the Board finds all of the suggested comparables to be significantly smaller or larger in size of living area as compared to the subject. In addition, four of the suggested comparables differ from the subject in exterior construction and one varies in age. After considering adjustments for size, age and construction, as well as other differences in both parties' suggested comparables when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's per square foot improvement assessment is supported by the properties contained in the record.

As a result of this analysis, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds the appellant has failed to adequately demonstrate that the subject dwelling was inequitably assessed by clear and convincing evidence and a reduction is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: October 31, 2008



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the

subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.