

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Michelle Caldwell DOCKET NO.: 21-01662.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 02-36-403-022

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Michelle Caldwell, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$18,659 **IMPR.:** \$152,835 **TOTAL:** \$171,494

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2021 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a 2-story dwelling of brick and wood siding exterior construction with 2,930 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2014 and is approximately 7 years old. Features of the home include an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a garage containing 736 square feet of building area. The property is located in Lindenhurst, Lake Villa Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends assessment inequity with respect to the improvement as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on three suggested equity comparables that are in the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject and located within 0.23 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables are improved with 2-story dwellings of wood siding exterior construction ranging in size from 3,280 to 3,535 square feet of living that are either 9 or 15 years old. Each comparable has an unfinished basement, one with finished area, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a garage ranging in size from 440 to 780 square feet of building area. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$95,842 to \$106,594 or from \$29.22

to \$31.44 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested the subject's improvement assessment be reduced to \$134,927 or \$30.27 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$171,494. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$152,835 or \$34.28 per square foot of living area.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on six suggested equity comparables that are in the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject and located within 0.12 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables are improved with 2-story dwellings of wood siding exterior construction ranging in size from 2,733 to 4,004 square feet of living area that were built from 2007 to 2014. Each comparable has an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a garage ranging from 650 to 819 square feet of building area. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$103,690 to \$141,168 or from \$35.26 to \$37.94 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the parties submitted a total of nine comparable properties for the Board's consideration, eight of which are not truly similar to the subject due to considerably smaller dwelling sizes when compared to the subject. Nevertheless, these nine comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$95,842 to \$141,168 or from \$29.22 to \$37.94 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$152,835 or \$34.28 per square foot of living area, falls within the range established on a price per square foot basis but above the range on an overall improvement assessment, which is logical given the subject's larger dwelling size when compared to the best comparables contained in the record. Based on this record and after considering adjustments to the comparables for differences from the subject, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

| 2           | 1. Fer        |
|-------------|---------------|
|             | Chairman      |
| a R         | asort Stoffen |
| Member      | Member        |
| Dan Dikini  | Sarah Bokley  |
| Member      | Member        |
|             |               |
| DISSENTING: |               |

# **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

| Date: | September 19, 2023 |
|-------|--------------------|
|       | Middle 14          |
|       |                    |

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Michelle Caldwell, by attorney: Robert Rosenfeld Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC 33 North Dearborn Street Suite 1850 Chicago, IL 60602

# **COUNTY**

Lake County Board of Review Lake County Courthouse 18 North County Street, 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085