

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Damian Kozina
DOCKET NO.: 16-30906.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 12-36-231-042-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Damian Kozina, the appellant(s); and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$2,906 IMPR.: \$35,308 TOTAL: \$38,214

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

# **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

# **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story, multi-family dwelling of masonry construction. The dwelling was constructed in 1965 and is located in Elmwood Park, Leyden Township, Cook County. The property is a class 2-11 per the Cook County Real Property Classification Ordinance.

The appellant argued that the fair market value of the subject property was not accurately reflected in its assessed value as the basis of this appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted a settlement statement disclosing the subject property was purchased on November 22, 2013 for \$199,000. Lastly, the appellant's pleadings regarding Section IV- Recent Sale Data confirmed the sale date, sale price, that the parties to the transaction were not related, the seller's mortgage was not assumed, and the subject was advertised for sale using a realtor.

The appellant also contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on four equity comparables.

Lastly, the appellant's pleadings state the subject contains 2,900 square feet of living area. No supporting evidence was submitted.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$38,214. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$382,140 when using the 2016 level of assessment for class 2-11 properties of 10% as determined by the Cook County Real Property Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted four sale comparables and eight equity comparables. In addition, the board of review submitted a brief stating the subject's sale was not an arm's length transaction. In support, the "deed trail" from the Cook County Recorder of Deeds was submitted which disclosed a *lis pendens/foreclosure* notice was recorded against the subject in May 2012 and a prior unrelated Board decision.

# **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds that the subject contains 4,026 square feet of living area. The appellant did not submit any evidence such as a survey or building sketch to disprove the subject's size per the board of review. Therefore, the subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$382,140 or \$94.92 per square foot of living area, land included and an improvement assessment of \$8.77 per square foot of living area.

The Board finds that the subject's sale price in November 2013 is reflective of the market value in 2013 and not the 2016 tax lien year. The 2013 sale date is too far removed in time from the January 1, 2016 lien date. Furthermore, the year the subject was sold was in a different assessment triennial than the 2016 tax year. Based on this evidence, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

The taxpayer also contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the board of review's comparables #1, #5, and #6. These comparables are similar in size, location, age, and construction. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$8.96 to \$9.63 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$8.77 per square foot of living area falls below the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

, Mai	no Illorios
	Chairman
21. Fer	a R
Member	Member
Robert Stoffen	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	E: February 13, 2019	
	Stee M Wagner	
	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board	

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Damian Kozina 8247 West Irving Park Road Chicago, IL 60634

# **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602