



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Nitish Shah
DOCKET NO.: 16-03245.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 15-16-104-008

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Nitish Shah, the appellant, by attorney Ronald Kingsley, of Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC in Lake Forest; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **A Reduction** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$45,376
IMPR.: \$153,584
TOTAL: \$198,960

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 3,016 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1996. Features of the home include a full basement with finished area, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a 484 square foot attached garage. The property has a 11,432 square foot site and is located in Buffalo Grove, Vernon Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three comparable sales located from .05 to .15 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables are described as two-story dwellings of frame exterior construction ranging in size from 2,785 to 3,432 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed from 1994 to 2001. The comparables have basements with finished areas. Additional features of the homes include central air conditioning; a fireplace and a garage

ranging in size from 484 to 722 square feet of building area. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 9,250 to 14,325 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from January 2015 to February 2016 for prices ranging from \$505,000 to \$620,000 or from \$180.65 to \$187.41 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's total assessment.

Additionally, the appellant submitted Multiple Listing Service (MLS) sheets for comparables #2 and #3 which indicates comparable #2 was recently updated and comparable #3 has a finished basement.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$211,743. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$638,549 or \$211.72 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.16% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales, one of which was submitted by the appellant. They are located from .086 to .349 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables are improved with two-story dwellings of frame exterior construction ranging in size from 2,834 to 3,432 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed from 1990 to 2001. The comparables have basements with finished areas, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a garage ranging in size from 462 to 722 square feet of building area. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 9,250 to 10,020 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from August 2014 to June 2016 for prices ranging from \$606,000 to \$624,500 or from \$180.65 to \$216.65 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested that the subject property's assessment be confirmed.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the parties submitted six suggested comparable sales for consideration which includes one common comparable. The Board gave less weight to the comparables #2, #3 and #4 submitted by board of review since they are located in a different neighborhood. Also, two of the comparables had sales dates that were not proximate to the January 1, 2016 assessment date and less indicative of market value.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be appellant's comparables along with board of review comparable #1 which is also appellant's comparable #1. The Board finds these three properties to be the most similar in location, design, age, dwelling size and features when compared to the subject. They sold from January 2015 to February 2016 for prices ranging from

\$505,000 to \$620,000 or from \$180.65 to \$187.41 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$638,549 or \$211.72 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls above the range established by the most similar comparable sales in this record.

After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment is not supported. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant demonstrated by a preponderance of the evidence that the subject was overvalued and a reduction in the subject's assessment is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: February 13, 2019



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Nitish Shah, by attorney:
Ronald Kingsley
Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC
13975 W. Polo Trail Drive
#201
Lake Forest, IL 60045

COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review
Lake County Courthouse
18 North County Street, 7th Floor
Waukegan, IL 60085